

**TETERBORO AIRCRAFT NOISE ABATEMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE (TANAAC)
MEETING
SUMMARY OF MINUTES**

October 28, 2020

ATTENDANCE

Maria Sheridan, TANAAC Co-Chair	Port Authority of NY & NJ
Paul Griffo, TANAAC Co-Chair	Borough of Rutherford
Scott Marsh, Manager Operations and Security	Port Authority of NY & NJ
Rick Vander Wende, Manager Contract Services	Port Authority of NY & NJ
Ayo Olanipekun, Program Manager	Port Authority of NY & NJ
Juan Rojas, Community Relations	Port Authority of NY & NJ
Ralph Tamburro, Program Manager	Port Authority of NY & NJ
Gabriel Andino, Manager, Noise Abatement	Teterboro Airport/AvPORTS
Michael Fiscus, Asst. Manager, Noise Abatement	Teterboro Airport/AvPORTS
Zack Miller, Noise Specialist	Teterboro Airport/AvPORTS
John Kastens, Manager, Airport Services	Teterboro Airport/AvPORTS
Kathleen Bergen	FAA
Veda Simmons	FAA
Maria Stanco, Deputy Regional Administrator	FAA
Steve Riethof	NJ Aviation Hall of Fame and Museum
Alex Gertsen	NBAA
Dave Belastock	TUG
Deputy Mayor Kathy Canestrino	City of Hackensack
Councilman Robert Robbins	Borough of Bogota
Borough Administrator Joseph D'Arco	Borough of Paramus
Gina Affuso, Borough Clerk	Borough of Wood-Ridge
Roy Luyster, Representative	Township of Rochelle Park
Dave Kingma, Representative	Township of Rochelle Park
Kenneth Goffstein, Alternate	Township of Teaneck
Lauren Gonnelli, Representing	Congressman Josh Gottheimer
Jennifer Mangano, Legislative Assistant	Congressman Josh Gottheimer
Gail Callandrillo, Community Affairs	The Valley Hospital
Robin Goldfischer, SVP Legal Affairs	The Valley Hospital
George Muller	Borough of Little Ferry
Wanda Portorreal	Village of Ridgefield Park

Teterboro Airport
October 28, 2020
Audio/Video Meeting via held via Webex
Minutes Summary

Ms. Maria Sheridan, TANAAC Co-Chair welcomed the committee members and thanked them for participating. Mr. Paul Griffo, TANAAC Co-Chair also welcomed everyone to the meeting.

Ms. Sheridan turned the meeting over to Mr. Gabriel Andino for New Business.

NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Andino welcomed everyone to the meeting and then turned the meeting over to Mr. Ayo Olanipekun, Project Manager for Part 150 Studies for both Newark and Teterboro Airports, to provide a Part 150 Study update.

Mr. Olanipekun reported on the Part 150 Study.

- Earlier this year the Port Authority submitted a preliminary Noise Compatibility Program (NCP) Report draft document to the FAA for their review. This was done as part of the Part 150 study and prior to the public review/commenting period. During the course of this process the PA addressed all FAA comments.
- Mr. Olanipekun provided a timeline of the Part 150 process:
 - After the FAA reviews the documentation, the PA releases a draft NCP report to the public and holds a public hearing/workshop to coincide with that. The PA addresses whatever comments come out of the workshop and public hearing. The PA then turns around and submits a final draft NCP to the FAA, where they do a 180-day review leading to an FAA Record of Approval. Afterwards a meeting with the FAA is held to formally publish the NCP. This then becomes part of public record and is announced in the Federal Register.
- Currently the PA does not have any updates regarding the draft Part 150 NCP. The status is the same as it was during the July TANAAC meeting. The PA is continuing to work internally on a path forward and hopes to have an update in the near future.

Mr. Andino shared a slide presentation of the Statistical Report for the period of January to September 2020.

- Aircraft movements are below normal with a total of 63,487, a decrease of 48.97% over 2019. This reflects the drop off in travel due to the pandemic. Nighttime movements (between 11:00 pm and 6:00 am) are down with a total of 3,062 which represents 4.82% of the total aircraft movements at the airport.
- Noise violations for departing aircraft for the first three quarters of 2020 were down significantly with a total of 29 violations. 26 were first time violations and 3 were second time violations. No aircraft were banned.
- Runway utilization has remained the same. Runway 19 continues to be used as the predominant runway for arrivals and Runway 24 is used for more than half of aircraft departures in 2020.

Helicopters continue to use the southern route most often. Totals for all helicopter routes have decreased significantly with the downturn in air traffic.

- The LDN(A) (day/night average aircraft noise levels) on the six permanent noise monitors and the one portable noise monitor reflect noise levels are down by approximately 50% which is consistent with air traffic movements being down. The results are as follows:
 - RMS 1 in Carlstadt showed a 3.1 decibels (dB) decrease from the level in 2019.
 - RMS 2 in Hasbrouck Heights showed a decrease of 1.8 (dB).
 - RMS 3 at the Hackensack University Medical Center (HUMC) showed a decrease of 3.4 (dB).
 - RMS 4 in Hackensack showed a decrease of 2.8 (dB) level.
 - RMS 5 in Bogota showed a decrease of 2.6 (dB).
 - RMS 6 in Moonachie showed an increase of 3.6 (dB).
 - RMS 8 in South Hackensack showed a reading of 51.0 (dB) since its inception on January 23, 2020.
- We had 16,197 noise complaints related to Teterboro Airport traffic received from 145 residents. This includes 12,486 complaints from 12 people who utilized a Third-Party Application. Maywood had 13,072 complaints from 6 residents; of that number 12,309 complaints were received from 1 resident using a Third-Party Application. Additionally, there were, 1,490 complaints from 20 callers in Hackensack, 442 complaints from 28 residents in Rutherford, 235 complaints from 2 residents in South Hackensack and 64 complaints from 12 residents in Carlstadt. The remaining TANAAC towns totaled 23 complaints from 12 residents. We had an increase in noise complaints even though we had a reduction in the number of complainants. This was predominately the result of one person using a third-party application to register complaints in an excessive manner.
- A breakdown of the complaints from northern non-TANAAC towns experiencing traffic from Runway 19 showed Woodcliff Lake with 178 complaints from 9 residents (which included 98 from 2 residents using a Third Party Application), Allendale with 66 complaints from 1 resident, Lyndhurst had 185 complaints from 3 residents, Warwick saw 96 complaints from 4 residents, Allendale had 63 complaints from 1 resident, Mahwah has 52 complains from 5 residents and Fort Lee saw 46 complaints from 1 resident. The remainder of towns each had less than 38 complaints year to date.
- The top five reasons given for complaints were “too loud and low” (12,858), followed by “too loud” 1,299, “excessive vibration” (690) “too early or too late” (670), and “too frequent” (487). The majority of complaints came from the Hackensack and Maywood area and mainly involve arrivals to runway 19. Complaints from Rutherford were mixed and mainly involve departure traffic and some arrivals coming in to Runway 6 from the south. Other complaints from communities to the far north involve aircraft approaching and landing using Runway 19 or Runway 24.

Ms. Sheridan turned the meeting over to Ms. Veda Simmons from the FAA to discuss FAA RNAV (GPS) Runway 19 Offset Procedure.

- The Environmental Assessment (EA) conducted in accordance with NEPA and FAA Order 1050.1F, Environmental Impacts: Policies and Procedures was completed on September 10, 2020.
- The procedure was developed in response to a TANAAC request and is scheduled to be published on December 31, 2020.

- No date has been established for when Air Traffic Controller (ATC) training will take place. Ms. Simmons will reach out to Mr. Andino and Ms. Sheridan once a date is available. The delay in establishing a training schedule is a national issue as a result of the current COVID 19 pandemic and not a local issue.

COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS

At this point Ms. Sheridan opened the meeting to comments and accepted Ms. Robin Goldfischer's request to be allowed to address the committee.

Ms. Goldfischer is the Senior Vice President and General Counsel for The Valley Hospital located in Ridgewood, New Jersey. Valley Health is in the process of building a new facility in Paramus, New Jersey. According to the information she has received the new flight path procedure planned for Teterboro will go directly over the site of this new facility. Ms. Goldfischer apologized for the late timing of her request, however, she stated that they were unaware of the new procedure prior to this week and were informed of it by a pilot who had been a recent patient at their hospital. She went over some statistics that she had available, expressed her grievance that the Valley Hospital was not directly notified of this new flight path and requested that publication of this new procedure be forestalled in order for The Valley Hospital to have an opportunity to review the new procedure to determine the impact that it may have on the new facility currently under construction in Paramus, NJ. Since the facility is a "healing destination" for patients they are particularly concerned with the potential of noise levels above "75 decibels" would impact areas both inside and outside of the new facility. The Valley Hospital has engaged two noise consultants to work with their architects to determine the impact that this may have on their facility.

Ms. Sheridan requested comment on Ms. Goldfischer's request from the members present at the meeting.

Ms. Veda Simmons observed that the "Quiet Visual" procedure was abandoned and that the RNAV procedure is scheduled to be published at the end of December. She recommended that Ms. Goldfischer provide her request to the TANAAC committee in writing.

Ms. Maria Stanco, the FAA Deputy Regional Administrator, mentioned that the review process for a new procedure is a long one and that the FAA with the assistance of TANAAC did an extensive outreach for the EA. TANAAC reached out to the Mayors and outside organizations in the surrounding area directly and sent notification to elected officials at the start of the project as well as prior to the public meeting that was held in January 2020. In addition, public notifications were published in newspapers in the area. Since this is not an FAA initiative, if TANAAC would like the FAA to pause the publication of the new procedure scheduled for December this would have to come as a written request from the TANAAC committee to the FAA.

Ms. Stanco also clarified that even though they anticipate publishing the new procedure by the end of December it will be some time before this procedure is implemented. In addition, the new approach is going to be an option used under certain circumstances and is not a replacement for the existing approach.

Ms. Goldfischer reminded the committee that they had not been notified by anyone regarding this new procedure and she felt that since they were a large facility in the area that they should have received some type of consideration with regard to notification on this issue. She again reiterated her request that all The Valley Hospital was looking for at this point was an opportunity to have their noise consultants review the information prior to the new procedure being published so that they could make an educated assessment as to what impact this new procedure would have on their facilities.

Ms. Sheridan requested that The Valley Hospital put their request in writing and send it to Gabe Andino and herself at TANAAC so that it could be shared with the TANAAC members and a vote taken.

Mr. Paul Griffo requested that The Valley Hospital also supply the data they used to determine that the noise levels would reach to a 75-decibel level over the new facility. Since average aircraft noise levels over Hackensack are in the 50-decibel range and planes fly much lower over Hackensack than they will over the new Valley Hospital site he was curious as to where their data came from. He also requested to know the contours in the area since existing contour maps are available and these could help determine what the issues are.

Ms. Goldfischer requested a meeting between Mr. Griffo and other members of TANAAC and her noise consultant who would be more conversant on the data and standards.

Mr. Griffo indicated that this was possible and that he would get together with airport representatives in order to see what could be accommodated.

Mr. Joseph D'Arco, representative for the Paramus Mayor's office, expressed his discontent over the fact that he had attended meetings last year and expressed his concerns in writing regarding noise of aircraft over the area of Paramus and he never received any response back to these written concerns. In agreement with The Valley Hospital he also asked that the publication of the new procedure be delayed until after The Valley Hospital's concerns had been addressed.

Ms. Sheridan questioned how the FAA typically responds to comments received by them during the EA process.

Ms. Stanco responded that comments that are received during the EA process, whether received in writing, during the public workshop or on line, are summarized and responded to within the EA document. Individuals would be responsible to go to the EA document for answers to their concerns. The EA document can be viewed online and a hard copy is available at the Paramus public library for review.

Ms. Goldfischer expressed her understanding that if a party was not a member of TANAAC and not conversant enough to look on line for the EA documentation that they would be left out of the process.

Ms. Stanco corrected her on this point and stated that notification on the issue was widely distributed. Public notices were published in local newspapers, letters, emails and phone calls were made directly to local officials as well.

Mr. D'Arco stated that he had attended the public meetings and he and the other mayors present in the audience had the sense that their objections were being ignored and that the FAA was going to proceed anyway no matter what was said. He went on to say that the towns such as Paramus most affected by these types of changes did not have a seat at the table and were left out. He said their concerns and objections were not taken into consideration. He finished by saying that he was going to bring his concerns over this issue to the Mayor of Paramus.

Ms. Sheridan then asked for any further comments or concerns.

At this point Mr. Roy Luyster, representative for Rochelle Park, stated that he receive a letter dated September 10th from the Air Traffic Organization regarding the EPA studies. The letter was addressed from an Andrew Peroni. He requested contact information for Mr. Peroni in order that he could contact him to obtain further details on this studies impact on Rochelle Park.

Ms. Stanco said that Mr. Peroni is an Environmental Specialist from the FAA. She recommended that Mr. Luyster put his request in writing, detailing the information he required and his questions and send that to Ms. Sheridan in order that she could forward it Ms. Stanco who would then see that the proper parties at the FAA received the request and could respond accordingly.

Mr. Luyster further indicated that he had gone to the library and reviewed the EA plan and did not see an issue effecting Rochelle Park at the time. Since he does not own a computer he would request that he receive a phone call to speak with someone about the letter he received on September 10th.

Ms. Goldfischer indicated that it seemed to her that a number of people had concerns about the new procedure and that she would going to put her concerns in writing and hoped that the others would do the same.

Ms. Kathy Canestrino, Deputy Mayor of Hackensack, came into the discussion at this point to express understanding of The Valley Hospital's concerns, but also to request that they confirm the current data of the 75-decibel figure with their noise consultants since The Valley Hospital site was much further away and much lower in elevation than Hackensack and she did not think that they would be experiencing that high a decibel level of sound. She said that the sound levels were an average figure over time and that Hackensack's average was in the 50-decibel level range and expressed her hope that data was being compared in an even manner and that all the parameters being looked at were similar.

Ms. Goldfischer thanked Ms. Canestrino for her input and welcomed the opportunity to have their noise consultants meet with Hackensack, members of TANAAC and the FAA, to be sure that the new procedure was the right thing to do. She said that they did not move their hospital next to an airport, they did not build their hospital next to an airport, and they had no idea that this was going on. To create a problem where one did not exist before made no sense to her and she would simply like to have to opportunity to pause and have their noise consultant look at the data to determine the impact if any on their hospital. She wants the opportunity to work on this together.

Ms. Canestrino agreed and said that everyone had to work together and that when you build near an airport things do change. When Hackensack Hospital was first built the airport did not have jet traffic and had less traffic volume. We have to work together and do the best for everyone involved. She indicated that she has been working with the airport for many years and that a lot of hard work went into the planning of the new procedure and she felt strongly that all could work together on this issue and come up with a solution.

Ms. Sheridan than asked if there were any further comments.

Ms. Goldfischer requested an address to send her information. Ms. Sheridan said she could email it to her attention and she would make sure it was received and provided for discussed with the TANAAC committee.

Mr. Luyster stated he thought that the original flight plan (which was cancelled) was to run along Rt 17.

Mr. Griffo agreed that the committee would like to look at the data to make sure everyone was comparing "apples to apples" on this issue.

Mr. Luyster requested hard copies of information from Ms. Goldfischer on elevations and high requirements for the new hospital structure. Ms. Goldfischer indicated that since Mr. Luyster had stated several times that he did not have a computer (except the one in his plane) that she would drop this information to Mr. Luyster by noon tomorrow at his address and email a copy to Ms. Sheridan as well.

Ms. Sheridan stated that any information that was received would be shared with the TANAAC committee members.

Ms. Goldfischer thanked everyone for listening to her request and expressed her optimism that they would all be able to find common ground on this issue.

OPEN DISCUSSION

With no other business to come before the committee, the meeting was adjourned.

The next regular meeting of TANAAC is scheduled for **January 27, 2020**.